



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

our minds, towards divine mysteries; but rather that by our minds thoroughly cleansed and purged from fancy and vanities, and yet subject and perfectly given up to the divine oracles, there may be given unto faith such things as are faith's."

[Read before the Baptist Autumnal Conference, Boston, Nov. 14, 1888.]

THE ANTE-NICENE FATHERS AND THE MOSAIC ORIGIN OF THE PENTATEUCH.

BY REV. NEWELL WOOLSEY WELLS,
Brooklyn, E. D.

In a series of articles lately published in the *Independent*, Professor Francis Brown, of Union Theological Seminary, gave the testimony of the New Testament Scriptures concerning the authorship of the Pentateuch. The conclusion at which the Professor arrived was that no warrant is to be found in those Scriptures for regarding as the literary composition of Moses other than a few scattered texts in the first five books of the Bible, and that, therefore, the inference that our Lord and his apostles held to the generally accepted view of the authorship of the Pentateuch has no basis in fact.

Though not acquiescing in the conclusion of the Professor it is not our desire to canvas the ground so thoroughly gone over by him. Our purpose is rather to ascertain, if possible, what was the conviction of the early church as it found expression in the writings of the Fathers. Certain is it that no conviction, whatever its character, attains wide currency in a brief period of time unless it may have the forced development that ensues upon a supernatural revelation. Ideas, like seeds, in order to their dissemination require the processes of successive seasons. Growth is a factor that must be taken into account in every harvest. And if we shall succeed in showing that the Fathers, following close upon the footsteps of the Apostles, held to the Mosaic origin of the greater portion of the Pentateuch, we shall certainly feel ourselves warranted in ascribing a like conviction to the Apostles themselves.

Our method will be to trace the evidence back from the close of the third century toward the days of the Apostles, taking first the testimony of the later writers, then that of those immediately preceding them, and so on until we come to that of those whose lives overlapped the period known as Apostolic.

In beginning our study we remark this fact, that in but one volume of all the early writings of the church is there to be found an out-and-out denial of the Mosaic authorship of the Pentateuch, and this is but a denial that the manual work of writing was performed by Moses in person. This denial may be found in the second "Clementine Homily," chap. xxxviii., and in the third Homily, chap. xlvii. The latter passage is interesting enough for quotation in full. "And Peter said: 'The Law of God was given by Moses, without writing, to seventy wise men, to be handed down, that the government might be carried on by succession. But after that Moses was taken up, it was written by some one, but not by Moses. For in the law itself it is written, "And Moses died; and they buried him," etc. But how could Moses write that Moses died?' " It will thus be seen that the modern "higher critic" is but treading the path marked out for

him by the forger of the "Clementines." The scientific instinct seems to have had a more extended development than has generally been believed to be the case. The marvel is, the tardiness with which it has reached the present status.

We take up first such testimony as may be found in the "Apostolical Constitutions," written for the most part about the close of the third century. Among other sentences occur these which we quote as pertinent to the subject in hand. "As Samuel made constitutions for the people concerning a king and Moses did so concerning priests in Leviticus, so do we also," etc. (Bk. II., Sec. 34). Again, "We believe Moses when he says: 'In the beginning God created the heaven and the earth'" (Bk. V., Sec. 7). Here, therefore, we find references to the book of Leviticus and the history of creation in Genesis as the literary compositions of Moses.

Archelaus, bishop of Carrha (A. D. 278) uses these words in his *Disputation with Manes*: "In Genesis, where Moses gives an account of the construction of the world, he makes no mention of the darkness either as made or not made" (22). Again: "When as yet there was no law embodied in writing God had compassion on the race of man and was pleased to give through Moses a written law to men" (28).

Cyprian, bishop of Carthage, who suffered martyrdom during the Valerian Persecution, A. D. 258, in his *Testimoniorum adversus Judæos* wrote as follows, ascribing to Moses words spoken by Jehovah: "That the dead rise again Moses intimates when he says in the bush, The 'Lord, the God of Abraham, the God of Isaac and the God of Jacob.'" And again in his Essay on Mortality he quotes Deut. VIII., 2 and XIII., 3, as the warnings of the Holy Spirit through Moses.

Novatian, than whom none was ever more loyal to what he conceived to be the truth, and who readily sealed his attachment to the truth under the Emperor Valerian, in his treatise *Concerning the Trinity* (chap. XVII.) uses these words: "What if Moses delivers to us in the beginning of his sacred writings, this principle by which we learn that all things were created and founded by the Son of God Moses introduces God commanding that there should be light at the first."

Lactantius, who though a layman, was pronounced by Jerome the most learned man of his age, was born near the middle of the third century and died about 330 A. D. His references are far more frequently to the Greek and Latin classics than to the Hebrew Scriptures. Still he gives us his idea as to the authorship of certain portions of the Pentateuch. Thus, in his *Divine Institutes* (Bk. IV.) we find; "Moses, in Numbers, thus speaks: 'There shall arise a Star out of Jacob and a Scepter shall arise out of Israel,' words which, it will be remembered, occur in the prophecy of Balaam." Again: "In Deuteronomy he (Moses) thus left it written," whereupon follows a citation of the passages occurring in chap. XVIII., 17-19. Still again: "Moses spoke to this effect in Deuteronomy; 'And thy life shall hang in doubt before thee; and thou shalt fear day and night and shalt have none assurance of thy life.'" Concerning this passage fairness requires us to state that the meaning of the Father may have been simply that Moses spoke the words recorded in the Book of Deuteronomy. But even should this prove the case the force of the other citations will not be invalidated thereby.

Going still farther back in the patristic line, we come to Origen, born 185 A. D., died 253 A. D., one of the most eminent names in the early church. In his *De Principiis* (Bk. I., chap. I.), we meet with this sentence: "In the writings of Mo-

ses they find it said, 'Our God is a consuming fire' (Deut. iv., 24). Again: "Concerning then the creation of the world what portion of Scripture can give us more information concerning it than the account which Moses has transmitted concerning its origin" (Bk. III., chap. 5). Still again: "This is pointed out by Moses when he describes the first creation of man in these words; 'And God said, Let us make man in our image, after our likeness'" (Bk. III., chap. 6). "The divinity and inspiration both of the predictions of the prophets and of the law of Moses have been clearly revealed and confirmed." "In Deuteronomy the legislation is made known with greater clearness than in those books which were first written" (Bk. IV., chap. 1). And in his work *Against Celsus* (Bk. IV., chap. 4) we read of "the first book of Moses entitled Genesis," in which Moses wrote an account of the deluge and "the Mosaic cosmogony of the six days."

Hyppolytus, whom Photeus makes a disciple of Irenaeus, and who wrote in the early part of the third century, says, in his *Refutation of all Heresies* (Bk. V., chap. 15) "..... Moses confirms their doctrine when he says, 'Darkness and mist and tempest'"—alluding to chaos—"or when he states that three were born in Paradise, Adam, Eve and the Serpent; or when he speaks of three, Cain, Abel, Seth; and again of three, Shem, Ham, Japheth." "Moses has spoken of the six days in which God made heaven and earth" (Bk. VI., chap. 9). "In reference to this very law each of his books has been written as the inscriptions evince. The first book is Genesis..... The inscription of the second book is Exodus." Having dwelt in chaps. 9, 10, 11, 12 and 13 upon the contents of the several books of the Pentateuch he alludes to them in chap. 14 as "the writings of Moses." In chap. 25 we read, "Moses asserts, 'The earth was invisible and unfashioned.'" Again, in Bk. VII., chap. 10, "..... that which has been stated by Moses, 'Let there be light and there was light.'" "Moses mentions this fiery God as having spoken from the bush" (Bk. VIII., chap. 2). "Moses mentions that the rod is changeably brandished for the plagues throughout Egypt" (Bk. VIII., chap. 7).

Among the prominent writings of the opening years of this century are those of Tertullian, who is known to the church as the most ancient of its Latin Fathers. He was born at Carthage in the year of our Lord 160 and died about 230 A. D. Among his polemic writings that have come to us, his treatises "*Against Marcion*" and "*Against the Jews*," are perhaps best known. In Bk. I., chap. 10 of the first mentioned work we find these words: "Although Moses..... seems to have been the first to introduce the knowledge of the God of the Universe in the temple of his writings, yet the birthday of that knowledge must not, on that account be reckoned from the Pentateuch; for the volume of Moses does not at all initiate the knowledge of the creation, but from the first gives out that it is to be traced from Paradise and Adam." In the fifth chapter of his tractate "*Against the Jews*," the words occur: "When the sacerdotal law was being drawn up through Moses in Leviticus." But it is characteristic of Tertullian that he rarely alludes to the books of the Bible by their individual names, but prefaces the majority of his allusions thereto with the phrase, "The Scripture saith." The above quotations however sufficiently indicate his conviction that the Pentateuch was Mosaic in its origin.

Theophilus of Antioch, writing in the last quarter of the second century, says *To Autolytus*, a well-informed heathen: "Moses, who lived many years before Solomon, or rather, the Word of God by him as an instrument says, 'In the begin-

ing God created the heaven and the earth" (Bk. II., chap. 10). Having cited at length various portions of the opening chapters of Genesis, Theophilus writes: "All these things the Holy Spirit teaches us, who speaks through Moses and the rest of the prophets" (Chap. 30). "Moses, our prophet and servant of God, in giving an account of the genesis of the world, related in what manner the flood came upon the earth," etc. (Bk. III., chap. 18). "Moses showed that the flood lasted forty days and forty nights" (Bk. III., chap. 19).

Clement, known as "of Alexandria," though probably an Athenian by birth, a Platonist in his philosophy, makes very frequent allusion in his *Exhortation* to the heathen to "the commands of Moses," "the law of Moses," "the words of Moses," and "the precepts of Moses," but there are very few passages that can be cited as of interest to us in our present study. In his *Stromata*, however, we find many indications as to his conviction concerning the authorship of certain portions of the Pentateuch. He asks his readers to "mark the epochs by comparison with the age of Moses and with the high antiquity of the philosophy promulgated by him." In chap. 5 of the first Book he speaks of Plato as "aided in his legislation by the books of Moses." "The all-wise Moses indicated by employing repetition in describing the incorruptibility of body and of soul in the person of Rebecca," etc. (Gen. XXIV., 16). "As Moses says 'Melchizedek, King of Salem,'" etc. (Bk. IV., chap. 25). "We find in Moses, 'No man shall see me and live'" (Ex. XXXIII., 20). "The philosophers of the Greeks have taken without acknowledgment their principal dogmas from Moses and the prophets" (Bk. V., chap. 1). "Moses, describing allegorically the divine prudence calls it the tree of Life planted in Paradise" (chap. 2). "Moses says that the body was formed of the ground." Deut. XXXII., 39, is quoted by Clement as occurring "in Moses" (Chap. 14).

In the Epistle of Barnabas which is known to have been in existence prior to Clement's time, although its exact date is uncertain, we read of the elevation of the serpent in the wilderness (Num. XXI.) as described "in Moses."

In chapter ninth of his *Legatio pro Christianis*, Athenagoras an Athenian philosopher wrote: "I think you cannot be ignorant.....of the writings of Moses, or of Isaiah and Jeremiah, the Spirit making use of them as the flute-player breathes into the flute," the standing illustration of "verbal inspiration" from his day until this present. Thereupon follows the quotation of Ex. XX., 2, 3, as among the writings of Moses.

Tatian, an Assyrian by birth, as is generally supposed, a sophist by profession, rarely alludes to the separate books of the Old Testament, but in his *Address to the Greeks* speaks of Moses as "the oldest of poets and historians" (chap. 31), and also says that "many of the sophists.....endeavored to adulterate whatever they learned from Moses" (Chap. 40).

Melito, bishop of Sardis, in a communication addressed to Onesimus, and quoted by Eusebius, makes this very interesting statement: "Having made myself accurately acquainted with the books of the Old Testament, I have set them down below and herewith send you. Their names are as follows, The five of Moses, Genesis, Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers and Deuteronomy;" etc. No clearer evidence could be given as to the general mind of the early church with regard to the authorship of the Pentateuch.

Irenaeus, whose life extended from about 130 A. D. to 202 A. D. writing *Against Heresies*, penned these words (Bk. I., chap. 18): "Moses.....says, 'In

the beginning God created the heaven and the earth.' " "Moses narrated the formation of the world" (Bk. II., chap. 2, sec. 5). "The Son of God is implanted everywhere throughout his (Moses') writings; at one time, indeed, speaking with Abraham, when about to eat with him, at another time with Noah, giving him the measurements (of the ark); at another inquiring after Adam; at another bringing down judgment on the Sodomites; and again when he becomes visible and directs Jacob on his journey and speaks with Moses from the bush. It would indeed be endless to recount the times in which the Son of God is exhibited by Moses" (Bk. IV., chap. 10, sec. 1).

This testimony of Irenaeus is rendered doubly interesting and important by the fact that an argument has been drawn by "higher critics" from a passage in Bk. III., chap. 21, sec. 2, in which it is asserted that, the Scriptures having been corrupted, Esdras was employed by God "to recast all the words of the former prophets, and to re-establish with the people the Mosaic legislation." The quotations which we have given go to prove conclusively that Irenaeus considered large portions, at least, of the Pentateuch to have come from the mind and hand of Moses.

But by far the greatest mass of testimony comes to us from the writings of the Samaritan Platonist, Justin, Martyr, who was put to death in 165 A. D. We quote at length from him for the double reason of the frequency of his allusions to the Mosaic Scriptures, and the intimacy of his connexion with Apostolic times and events.

In his *First Apology*, written A. D. 148, we read that the destruction of Sodom and Gomorrah (Gen. XIX.) is related by Moses (LIII.); that the prophet Moses was older than all writers and that the prophecy recorded in Gen. XLIX., 10, was predicted by him (LIV.). This passage, it will be remembered, occurs among the predictions of the dying Patriarch, Jacob. Again: "Through Moses the Spirit spake thus, 'In the beginning,' etc. (LIX.). Num. XXI. is alluded to as "in the writings of Moses" (LX.). ".....the writings of Moses.....thus it is written in them; 'And the angel of the Lord appeared,' " the passage quoted being Ex. III., 2. "And if," continues Justin, "you desire to learn what follows, you can do so from the same writings" (i. e., those of Moses). "They were the first of all men to busy themselves in the search after God; Abraham being the father of Isaac and Isaac of Jacob, as Moses wrote."

In the *Dialogue with Trypho* we read, "Moses affirms" followed by quotations from Ex. XXXII., 6, and Deut. XXXII., 15. "It was told you by Moses in the book of Genesis" (xx.). "Moses declares," Gen. XVIII., 1-XIX., 28 (LVI.) "Listen to the words expressly employed by Moses," Gen. XXI., 9-12. (LVI.) "It is again written by Moses" Gen. XXXI., 10-13, (LVIII.). "The word of God by Moses," Gen. I., 26, 28. "The words narrated by Moses," Gen. III., 22 (LXII.). ".....the prophecy announced by the patriarch Jacob and recorded by Moses," (LXIX.). "We have it recorded by Moses in the beginning of Genesis that the serpent beguiled Eve and was cursed" (LXXIX.). We are told (xc.) that the battle with Amalek is recorded "in the writings of Moses." "Moses says somewhere in Exodus, the following" (CXXVI.). "Moses says that God appeared unto Abraham" (CXXVI.). See Gen. XVIII., 2. "What Moses wrote"—Gen. XIX., 24—"took place," (CXXVII.). "I would now adduce some passages which I had not recounted before. They are recorded by the faithful servant Moses in parable." Whereupon follows Deut. XXXII., 43, *sqq.* (CXXX.).

In his *Hortatory Address to the Greeks* (XII.) Justin says: "The history of Moses is by far more ancient than all profane histories, which he wrote in the Hebrew character by the Divine inspiration." "What the first prophet Moses said about Paradise" (XXVIII.). "Moses wrote that God spoke to him about the tabernacle in the following words"—Ex. XXV., 9, 40—(XXIX.). "Moses first mentions the name of man and then after many other creations he makes mention of the formation of man" (XXX.). "Moses' history, speaking in the person of God, says, 'Let us make man,' etc. (XXXIV.).

Our last citation is from Clement, bishop of Rome, the contemporary of some of the Apostles, who, in his First Epistle (XLIII.), wrote these words: "The blessed Moses. noted down in the sacred books all the instructions which were given him."

Here then we have a volume of evidence as to the general conviction of the early Christian church which, it seems to us, leaves the matter in no uncertainty whatever. In the light of it are we not warranted in interpreting the words of the apostles and of our Savior as expressive of their convictions as to the Mosaic origin of the Pentateuch? If any weight should ever attach to circumstantial evidence we know of no case in which it might more deservedly do so than in that before us. How to account for the prevalence of the conviction which we have found existing in the church of the second and third centuries without holding the presence of the same conviction in the church of the first century is a problem which, we believe, Professor Brown would find it difficult to solve. It is but a quibble to urge the closing verses of Deuteronomy as a proof of the impossibility of a Mosaic authorship. As well assert that Paul Janet did not write "Final Causes" because Professor Flint has written an introduction to that work. The question as to whether Moses employed documents in his work of composing or constructing the Pentateuch has no bearing upon our present study. The one question which has engaged our attention has been: What was the generally received opinion at and immediately after the time of our Savior as to the authorship of the Pentateuch? Certainly if the Christian fathers truly represent the Christian view, and if Josephus and Philo truly represent the Jewish view, our answer need not long be delayed.

THE REINS.

BY REV. J. G. LANSING,

West-Troy, N. Y.

The word *Reins* occurs fourteen times in the Old Testament, and once in the New. The Hebrew word is כְּלִיֹּת. The Greek word is νεφρός. In the Septuagint כְּלִיֹּת is rendered νεφρός. From the fourteen times in which the word *Reins* occurs in the Old Testament, it is in one instance to be excluded, viz., in Isa. XI., 5, where we read concerning the Messiah and his government, "And faithfulness shall be the girdle of his *reins*." The word here is not כְּלִיֹּת, but חֲלָצִים, a word which in every other instance is rendered, and is here also to be rendered, *loins*.

Lexicographers give the following definitions of the term. Gesenius defines כְּלִיֹּת, first, *the kidneys, reins*; second, by metonymy, used of the *inmost mind*, as the seat of the desires and affections. The Greek νεφρός is defined simply *the kid-*